

Date: February 28, 2024
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

ABSTRACT

Resolution No. 4630

This resolution adopts MTC's FY2023-24 Productivity Improvement Program (PIP).

This resolution includes the following attachment:

Attachment A: Productivity Improvement Program for Large and Small Transit Operators

Further discussion of this action is contained in the Programming and Allocations Committee Summary Sheet for February 14, 2024.

Date: February 28, 2024
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

Re: MTC Productivity Improvement Program

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
RESOLUTION NO. 4630

WHEREAS, Public Utilities Code (PUC) section 99244 provides that each transportation planning agency shall annually identify, analyze, and recommend potential productivity improvements which could lower the operating costs of transit operators within the area under its jurisdiction; and

WHEREAS, as provided for in Government Code sections 66500 et seq., the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is the regional transportation planning agency for the San Francisco Bay Area; and

WHEREAS, PUC section 99244 provides that recommendations for improvements and productivity shall include, but not be limited to, those recommendations related to productivity made in the triennial performance audits of transit operators conducted pursuant to PUC section 99246; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99244, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made a reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvement recommendations prior to approving the allocation of Transportation Development Act (TDA) funds in an amount greater than was allocated to the operator in the preceding fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99314.7, MTC is required each fiscal year, to make a finding that a transit operator has made reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvements pursuant to PUC section 99244, prior to approving the allocation of State Transit Assistance (STA) funds to the operator for operating purposes; and

WHEREAS, in accordance with PUC section 99233.2, MTC may support the regional transportation planning process by providing technical assistance funding to transit operators or other entities to implement transit productivity improvements; and

WHEREAS MTC Resolution No. 4619 adopted regional accountability measures and identified that these measures be included as productivity improvement projects for transit agencies receiving state or regional Senate Bill 125 funds; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, that MTC adopts the productivity improvement projects set forth in Attachment A to this resolution, and incorporated herein by reference; and

RESOLVED, that MTC finds that all transit operators identified in Attachment A have made reasonable effort in implementing productivity improvements and are eligible for allocations of TDA and STA funds next fiscal year in accordance with PUC sections 99244 and 99314.7.

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'AP', with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Alfredo Pedroza, Chair

The above resolution was approved by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission at a regular meeting of the Commission held in San Francisco, California, and at other remote locations, on February 28, 2024.

Date: February 28, 2024
W.I.: 1514
Referred By: PAC

Attachment A
Resolution No. 4630
Page 1 of 5

Fiscal Year 2023-2024 Productivity Improvement Program

All Operators

Transit Operator: All Bay Area Transit Operators

Project Title: Active Participation in Advancement of Regional Initiatives¹

Project Goal: Improve passenger experience and enhance transit efficiency.

Project Description: The Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Task Force was convened by MTC to guide the future of the Bay Area’s public transportation network as the region adjusted to new conditions created by the COVID-19 pandemic. In 2021, the Commission adopted the Transit Transformation Action Plan, leveraging this group’s recommendations to document a series of near-term actions needed to begin transforming the region’s transit network into a more connected, efficient, and user-focused system. In 2023, the Regional Network Management framework, including the RNM Council, was established to guide regional transit network management activities. All Bay Area transit operators will support the implementation of efforts identified in the Transit Transformation Action Plan and in the RNM Council’s Work Plan, across the themes of Fares and Payment (including transit fare policy and integration pilots); Customer Information (including regional mapping and wayfinding initiatives); Transit Network Efficiency; Accessibility (including paratransit streamlining and county-based mobility management efforts); and Funding.

Appendix 1, SB 125 Regional Initiative Participation Checklist, enumerates expectations for satisfactory implementation of this project.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

¹ This PIP project is consistent with the SB 125 Regional Accountability Measure titled “Active Participation in Advancement of Regional Initiatives”. All transit operators, including those receiving SB 125 funds, must demonstrate advancement of these efforts.

All Senate Bill 125 Funding Recipients²

Transit Operator: All Bay Area Transit Operators Receiving SB 125 Funds (NEW)

Project Title: Schedule Coordination

Project Goal: Improve passenger experience and enhance transit efficiency.

Project Description: Provide ongoing participation in efforts to improve scheduled connections between operators and take necessary steps to align operator/driver sign-up processes to facilitate connections.

Appendix 2, SB 125 Schedule Coordination Checklist, describes expectations for satisfactory implementation of this project.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Transit Operator: All Bay Area Transit Operators Receiving SB 125 Funds (NEW)

Project Title: General Transit Feed Specification (GTFS) Audit

Project Goal: Improve passenger experience.

Project Description: Complete audit checklist in accordance with guidelines provided by MTC in order to assess the agency's quality of data delivery and develop recommendations for improvement if needed.

Appendix 3, SB 125 General Transit Feed Specification (GTFS) and GTFS-Real Time (RT) Compliance Checklist, outlines expectations for satisfactory implementation of this project.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Regional/Multi-County

Transit Operator: Alameda-Contra Costa Transit District (AC Transit) (NEW)

² Transit operators receiving SB 125 funds include: AC Transit, ACE, BART, Caltrain, ECCTA, Golden Gate Transit, LAVTA, NVTA, SFMTA, SolTrans, and WestCAT.

Project Title: Report on Realign Service Planning Initiative

Project Goal: Enhance transit efficiency.

Project Description: Provide a written report on the interim findings of AC Transit's Realign Service Planning Initiative, including estimated ridership growth benefits and lessons learned which could inform other agency service redistribution efforts.

Estimated Completion Date: December 2024

Transit Operator: Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) (NEW)

Project Title: Implement New Fare Gates System-wide

Project Goal: Curtail fare evasion.

Project Description: Continue progress in implementation of new fare gates system-wide in a matter that facilitates completion by the end of 2025.

Estimated Completion Date: December 2025

Transit Operator: Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) (NEW)

Project Title: Report on Ambassador/Crisis Prevention Program(s)

Project Goal: Enhance passenger safety and security.

Project Description: Provide a written report on the effectiveness of BART's Ambassador/Crisis Prevention program(s) including recommendations for improvement and/or expansion, and an assessment of opportunities for coordination with connecting agencies. A report should be provided on an annual basis prior to the allocation of funds in a given fiscal year.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Transit Operator: Golden Gate Bridge, Highway and Transportation District (NEW)

Project Title: North Bay Transit Optimization Collaboration

Project Goal: Enhance transit efficiency.

Project Description: Summarize efforts to provide active participation and collaboration with Marin and Sonoma County transit providers in efforts to optimize North Bay Transit service. A report should be provided on an annual basis prior to the allocation of funds in a given fiscal year.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Transit Operator: Peninsula Corridor Joint Powers Board (Caltrain) *(NEW)*

Project Title: Report on Crisis Prevention Program

Project Goal: Enhance passenger safety and security.

Project Description: Provide a written report on the effectiveness of Caltrain's Crisis Prevention program including recommendations for improvement and/or expansion, and an assessment of opportunities for coordination with connecting agencies. A report should be provided on an annual basis prior to the allocation of funds in a given fiscal year.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

San Francisco County

Transit Operator: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) *(NEW)*

Project Title: Report on Fare Collection

Project Goal: Curtail fare evasion.

Project Description: Provide a written report on SFMTA's fare collection procedures and opportunities and/or recommendations for reducing fare evasion. A report should be provided on an annual basis prior to the allocation of funds in a given fiscal year.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Transit Operator: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) *(NEW)*

Project Title: Report on Ambassador/Crisis Prevention Program(s)

Project Goal: Enhance passenger safety and security.

Project Description: Provide a written report on the effectiveness of SFMTA's Ambassador/Crisis Prevention program(s) including recommendations for improvement and/or expansion, and an assessment of opportunities for coordination with connecting agencies. A report should be provided on an annual basis prior to the allocation of funds in a given fiscal year.

Estimated Completion Date: Ongoing

Appendix 1: SB 125 Regional Initiative Participation Checklist

Instructions: To assess satisfaction of the SB 125 Regional Accountability Measure related to support for regional initiatives, agency should note their advancement of each activity in the checklist below during FY2023-24.

Mark Yes, No, or N/A for each row, and provide context in the Comments field. For Question 13, elaborate on any other initiatives that the agency undertook in FY2023-24 to support Regional Network Management or implementation of the Transit Transformation Action Plan.

Activity	Yes	No	N/A	Comments
RNM Council				
1. Active participation in RNM Council meetings				
Fare Coordination and Integration				
2. Participation in Clipper BayPass pilot program				
3. Participation in Clipper START pilot program				
4. Active participation in staff working groups to advance regional transit fare coordination and integration				
Customer Information				
5. Active participation in staff working group(s) to develop Regional Mapping & Wayfinding Standards				
6. Active participation in efforts to improve real-time transit information				
7. Active participation in efforts to improve public communications				
8. Active participation in efforts to coordinate on customer satisfaction surveys				
Transit Network				
9. Active participation in staff working group(s) to coordinate on transit priority initiatives				
10. Coordination with the Transit 2050+ team as needed (e.g., data requests, attendance at meetings, etc.)				
11. Active participation in subregional integration efforts				
Accessibility				
12. Active participation in staff working group(s) to coordinate on the Access & Mobility work plan				

Other Regional Network Management Involvement
13. Please describe other activities related to Regional Network Management or Transit Transformation Action Plan initiatives that the agency actively participated in during Fiscal Year 2023-24.
MTC Comments
<i>For MTC staff to fill out. Please leave blank.</i>

Appendix 2: SB 125 Schedule Coordination Checklist

1. Has your agency implemented coordinated operator sign-ups in January and August as part of the current signed labor agreement?
 - Yes
 - Negotiation in-progress or expected in upcoming cycle
 - No
 - N/A

2. If implementation of coordinated operator sign-ups in January and August has not yet occurred, when do you anticipate implementation will be complete?

3. Is your agency actively participating in the development of the Bay Area Transit Reliability and Accessibility Network Scheduling Framework and Equitable Regional Plan (Bay Area TRANSFER Plan)?
 - Yes
 - No
 - N/A

4. Please describe any other efforts your agency has taken related to schedule coordination during Fiscal Year 2023-24.

Appendix 3: SB 125 General Transit Feed Specification (GTFS) and GTFS-Real
Time (RT) Compliance Checklist

Contact

Please provide the contact information

Name: _____
Title: _____
Agency: _____
Email: _____
Phone: _____

Basic GTFS compliance

1. Is your GTFS feed publicly available at a stable URL?
 Yes
 No
 N/A
2. Is your data provided under an open data license?
 Yes
 No
 N/A
3. Can your data be validated by the 511 SF Bay system without any errors?
 Yes
 No
 N/A
4. Is your data made available at least 2 weeks in advance of the service change effective date?
 Yes
 No
 N/A

Basic GTFS-RT compliance

1. Is your data complete with all three feeds – Trip Updates, Vehicle Positions, and Alerts?
 Yes
 No
 N/A
2. Is your data publicly available at stable URLs?
 Yes
 No
 N/A
3. Is your data provided under an open data license?

- Yes
 - No
 - N/A
4. Can your data be validated by the 511 SF Bay system without any errors?
- Yes
 - No
 - N/A

GTFS beyond basic compliance

1. Cal-ITP's latest California Transit Data Guidelines recommends compliance with the following:
- a. stops.txt file has valid non-empty non-null values for all records in the wheelchair_boarding field.
 - b. trips.txt file has valid non-empty non-null values for all records in the wheelchair_accessible field.
 - c. stops.txt file includes tts_stop_name data, specially for those stops that are commonly mispronounced.
 - d. shape data be provided accurately for all trips.

Does your data satisfy the above recommendations?

- Yes
 - No
 - N/A
2. Does your data include Pathways data?
- Yes
 - No
 - N/A
3. Does your data follow GTFS Best Practices (reference provided at the end)?
- Yes
 - No
 - N/A
4. Do you provide complete data for all fixed route and demand responsive (GTFS-Flex) routes?
- Yes
 - No
 - N/A
5. Bay Area Regional Transit Data Guidelines recommends compliance with the following:
- a. routes.txt file has data in the route_short_name field.
 - b. stops.txt file for real-time enabled agencies has unique numeric stop_code values with MTC assigned prefixed digits for all stops.
 - c. trips.txt file has trip_headsign and direction_id values.
 - d. directions.txt, route_attributes.txt, and calendar_attributes.txt GTFS+ files are included.
 - e. calendar.txt file has at least one service record with one of the day values set to '1'.

Does your data satisfy the above recommendations?

- Yes
- No
- N/A

GTFS-RT beyond basic compliance

1. Does your data follow GTFS-RT Best Practices (reference provided at the end)?
 - Yes
 - No
 - N/A
2. Cal-ITP's latest California Transit Data Guidelines recommends compliance with the following:
 - a. Data represents all fixed route services in RT feeds.
 - b. Data represents all planned (SCHEDULED and CANCELED) and unplanned (ADDED) trips in RT feeds.
 - c. Vehicle Positions feed fully represents Trip Updates feed.
 - d. Trip Updates and Vehicle Positions feeds update every 20 seconds with updated timestamps.
 - e. Unplanned or short-notice service changes are represented in RT unless an updated GTFS schedule feed is disseminated in time for most trip planners.

Does your data satisfy the above recommendations?

- Yes
- No
- N/A

3. Do you perform real-time prediction accuracy monitoring?
 - Yes
 - No
 - N/A
4. If you answered yes in the previous question, how often do you perform monitoring?
 - Weekly
 - Monthly
 - Quarterly
 - Yearly
 - Others

Please also attach a sample monitoring report if possible.

Please describe any efforts your agency has taken to audit the accuracy of GTFS-RT predictions. Attach any relevant reports or data describing accuracy assessment findings.

Please suggest any recommendations you may have for data quality improvement.

Reference

- a. [General Transit Feed Specification](#)
- b. [GTFS Best Practice](#) & [GTFS-RT Best Practice](#)
- c. [California Transit Data Guidelines v3.1](#)
- d. Bay Area Regional Transit Data Guidelines – available on request